

ISRG Journal of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences (ISRGJAHSS)



ISRG PUBLISHERS

Abbreviated Key Title: ISRG J Arts Humanit Soc Sci

ISSN: 2583-7672 (Online)

Journal homepage: <https://isrgpublishers.com/isrgjahss>

Volume – II Issue-VI (November-December) 2024

Frequency: Bimonthly



MODEL COLLABORATIVE GOVERNANCE IN PARKING MANAGEMENT IN MAKASSAR CITY

Syharuddin^{1*}, Manan Sailan², Hamsu Abdul Gani³

^{1, 2, 3} Universitas Negeri Makassar

| **Received:** 03.12.2024 | **Accepted:** 08.12.2024 | **Published:** 11.12.2024

*Corresponding author: Syharuddin

Universitas Negeri Makassar

Abstract

This study aims to analyze the collaboration process in parking management in Makassar City, analyze the determinant factors in parking management collaboration in Makassar City and produce a prototype ideal model for parking management collaboration in Makassar City. This study uses a qualitative descriptive method with a phenomenological approach, the data sources used consist of primary data through interviews with informants and secondary data through the study of various references relevant to the focus of the research. The data collection method is through interviews, observations and review of documentation related to the focus of the research. The data analysis techniques used are data reduction, data presentation and conclusion drawn. This research was carried out in Makassar City. The results of the study show that the collaborative process in parking management in Makassar City is still ineffective which is characterized by a low level of public awareness in complying with all parking rules, still weak supervision of the commitment of parking attendants in implementing the amount of parking fees based on the amount stated on the tickets, still weak supervision of business license operations by not heeding ANDALALIN (Traffic Impact Analysis), The determinant factor in parking management collaboration in Makassar City is institutional design, in addition, another determinant factor is facilitative leadership that has not been effective. The current parking management collaboration model in Makassar City that implements triple helix is not effective. Thus, it is recommended that the Greater Makassar Parking Perumda initiate to hold regular meetings with all stakeholders involved, improve the supervision system on how parking attendants work, and prepare regulations on Standard Operating Procedures (SOP) for parking attendant recruitment to be more directed, Furthermore, implement the "Penta Helix PAKONTAKI collaboration model" (Integrated, Education-Based, and Technological Innovation Parking Management) in the management of parking in Makassar City.

Keywords: Collaborative, Governance, Parking Management.

INTRODUCTION

The existence of a government is a mandate and commitment in order to foster and build a more just and prosperous life. Therefore, the task of the government is essentially to organize, regulate and serve the community as well as possible. This commitment can only be carried out if there is interaction from the community who feel that their government has been running and leads to efforts to protect and serve it. Furthermore, it is enshrined in the general provisions of Article 1 of Law Number 23 of 2014 stating "That the Regional Government is the head of the region as an element of the Regional Government organizer who leads the implementation of government affairs that are the authority of the autonomous region" so that this is a very potential opportunity as well as giving a strong signal that each region must be independent with consequences where the region must be able to manage sustainability and development dynamically, including: in terms of seeking its own funds for development and government operational costs.

The Makassar City Government established Makassar City Regional Regulation No. 17 of 2006 concerning the Management of Public Roadside Parking in the Makassar City Area. The community certainly hopes that with this regulation it will be able to suppress the occurrence of congestion and irresponsible illegal parking, as stipulated in Article 9 point 1 of the Makassar City Regional Regulation Number 17 of 2006 which states that: "it is forbidden to place motor vehicles and or other means of transportation outside the designated parking lot. Then Article 10 is emphasized that "parking users and parking attendants are required to maintain security, order, and cleanliness of parking, place vehicles in an orderly manner so as not to interfere with the traffic of people, goods and vehicles. Complying with the applicable service provisions and parking rates, parking attendants are required to provide parking tickets to parking lot users. Parking attendants are required to wear uniforms and/or identification cards determined by the directors of Perumda Parking Makassar Raya.

The growing population and increasing vehicle ownership add to the demand for road space for traffic activities. Parking facilities for the public can also function as one of the traffic control tools. To meet these needs, certain areas can provide certain facilities for the public which are pursued as an independent business activity and collect fees.

Table 1.1 Number Of Vehicles in Makassar City

No.	Vehicle Type	Year		
		2019	2020	2021
1	Passenger Car	127.584	133.939	135.947
2	Motorbike	718.326	727.856	680.077
Total		845.910	861.795	806.024

Source: Makassar City in Figure for 2022.

Based on the table above, it shows that there is a growth in the number of motor vehicle ownership, especially passenger cars and motorcycles in Makassar City. The vehicle data is only managed by 1,702 parking attendants spread across 1,125 parking points accumulated in 15 sub-districts in Makassar City. Therefore, proper governance skills are needed in parking management so that it can unravel congestion, but until now the management of roadside parking in the Makassar City Area has not run optimally

as mandated by Makassar City Regional Regulation No. 17 of 2006, this will certainly have a bad impact on the quality of service to the community, especially parking on the roadside of Makassar City.

There are many complaints from the public regarding the parking service system on the side of the road which often results in a slowdown in traffic flow in the surrounding area. This is because the parking attendant only directs road users who are parking at will without looking at the traffic conditions around them so that they always prioritize the vehicle they are leading, So far the standard operating procedures (SOP) to be applied by parking attendants, including the use of tickets are only used as a formality because the receipt of levies by the Makassar Raya Parking PD is not based on the number of tickets issued, but only based on the daily target between the Greater Makassar Parking PD through its collectors and parking attendants, so that there is a very large potential for leakage of the levy collection.

The use of public road facilities as parking lots causes narrowing of the highway and causes congestion problems. Likewise, public complaints about the tariff issue are often a question for all of us where the value is so expensive such as motor vehicles Rp 5,000 to Rp 10,000 per parking, sometimes even a parking fee of Rp 20,000 to Rp 40,000 per parking is charged. Even though what is stated on the parking attendant ticket is Rp. 3,000 for motorcycles and Rp. 5,000 for car vehicles and valid for one time parking, this is in accordance with the Legal Basis of the Makassar City Regional Regulation which is contained in the Decree of the Board of Directors of the Makassar Raya Parking PD Number 129/20-S.Kep.Dir/XI/2017, so this certainly triggers to question the flow of funds, especially since parking attendants rarely give tickets to motorists or parking service users.

Then the increase in road sections that is not balanced with the increase in the number of vehicles in Makassar City. Thus, this is a factor that causes congestion, namely the number of vehicles in Makassar has exceeded the available parking capacity. coupled with the undisciplined behavior of highway users, public awareness in using the available parking spaces is still very low, as the results of research by Rumantir, et. al. (2021) produced data that cooperation by all stakeholder elements has not been optimal in the management of roadside parking in Semarang City so that it seems subjective and politicized in parking management, further revealed by Hallan, et. al. (2015) that the coordination phase is built on the element of trust needed between groups.

As stated by Ansell and Gash (2007), the effectiveness of the collaboration process is measured through five stages, namely face-to-face meetings, building trust, commitment to the process, mutual understanding, intermediate results, then the collaboration process is certainly influenced by the determinant aspects that determine the effectiveness of the collaboration process or not.

Through this research, of course, we will see the gaps that occur in the field. Thus, the results of this research will later provide recommendations for an effective collaboration model in the management of roadside parking in Makassar City, as we know that coordination is a process of a series of activities in the context of integrating and aligning goals and work plans that have been set on all elements, functional fields and departments to produce a uniform and harmonious action effectively and efficiently. In an organization, coordination must be provided by superiors in completing tasks so that the delivery of information becomes clear

and the division of work to subordinates is in accordance with the authority received.

The success in achieving the collaboration put forward by Chris Huxham and Paul Hibbert in O'Flynn and want to (2008) is:

1. *Achieving outcomes*
Results are one of the most important things for all parties to collaborate, including the government, entrepreneurs and the community. Where the success in this collaboration is seen from various points of view, for example, one of the people involved sees it as a fortune, but on the other hand it can be considered as a reduction in income by the other party so that in collaboration must reach a consensus or mutual agreement.
2. *Getting the process to work*
The process of individual and organizational collaboration is not only oriented to results, but they are also proud of their involvement in the process because the process is important in the implementation of collaboration.
3. *Reaching emerging milestone*
Sometimes the size and size of a collaboration event can be a big initiative and is referred to as an important moment to occur and also referred to as Obstacles. In collaboration, differences of opinion often occur, but this is believed by many people that with effective cooperation, collaboration can be said to be successful.
4. *Gaining recognition – from others*
The ongoing collaborative process and the different results obtained to apply to its consumers are not seen as the only goal. But they or the organization in the collaboration also want a recognition where this recognition is a legitimate form of appreciation by the community. A person's recognition seems to be the type of recognition we often hear through people but they also like that their organization is also recognized.
5. *Acknowledging personal pride in championing a partnership*

In accordance with what has been said before, people tend to seek recognition, therefore they are not ashamed to show that it is their role that the collaboration can be successful. People need to be able to identify the success they have achieved and see that success as their achievement. Being at a level where individuals are willing to openly acknowledge and demonstrate their role in collaboration is essential. If people describe themselves as heroes in collaboration stories, then it is one of the indicators in the type of collaboration success and also a positive outcome.

The implementation of collaboration is greatly influenced by the right and competent leader, knowledge is also an important capacity in the collaboration process. *The stakeholders* involved must be parties who have the right capabilities in the field, so that the collaboration process can run according to expectations. Meanwhile, the intended resource capacity can be in the form of budget resources, human resources, and available facilities or technology.

RESEARCH METHODS

This research was carried out in Makassar City, the research method used was qualitative descriptive with a phenomenological approach, the data sources used consisted of primary data through interviews with informants and secondary data through the study of

various references relevant to the focus of the research. The data collection method is through interviews, observations and review of documentation related to the focus of the research. The data analysis techniques used are data reduction, data presentation and conclusion drawn.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

A. Parking Management Collaboration Process in Makassar City.

1. Face-to-Face Dialogue

Parking is one of the important aspects of urban mobility, so that the government collaboration model is the main pillar in parking management in the city of Makassar by collaborating with various related parties, including government agencies, the private sector, and active participation from the community, as an important element that plays a role in formulating and implementing policies that have a positive impact on the development of the city, the sustainability of collaboration in the management of parking on the city's public roadsides Makassar has proven to be the key to success in overcoming these challenges, each party continues to be committed to working together and finding the best solutions to increase efficiency and comfort for all city residents. The collaboration team will hold regular meetings to evaluate policy implementation and find ways to improve and overcome obstacles that may arise.

In the midst of the rapid growth of the city of Makassar, the problem of parking on the side of public roads has become a serious problem that causes congestion and confusion for motorists. But through an innovative collaborative process, various parties such as the government, traffic police and transportation agencies joined hands to overcome this challenge, first forming a collaborative team consisting of representatives of various related institutions and communities, with the aim of uniting a mutually supportive vision and action plan, then, the team conducted an in-depth analysis of the parking situation in various areas of the city, and involve the community in the consultation process, such as public meetings, discussions, and surveys, to explore meaningful views and inputs so that with a face-to-face dialogue between Perumda Parking Makassar Raya, the Makassar City Transportation Agency and the Makassar City Police Satlantas is the key to success in managing the parking system in Makassar City, through this direct communication the parties can convey their views to each other, needs, and problems faced to find effective solutions and provide space for evaluation of policies that have been implemented and improvements needed in accordance with the dynamics of urban development.

2. Building Trust

The collaborative process in parking management in Makassar City plays an important role in creating an efficient, safe, and orderly parking system, of course, involving surveys, data analysis, and collecting feedback from parking service users, other stakeholder communities, after problems and needs are identified, the next step is to form a collaborative team consisting of government representatives, transportation authorities, parking companies and civil society, this team is responsible for designing and implementing effective solutions in overcoming parking problems in Makassar City.

Parking management in Makassar City is a clear example of a collaborative process involving various parties, building trust is one of the key aspects that must be considered in maintaining the

smooth and successful cooperation, the collaborative process of parking management in Makassar City from the perspective of building trust can be done by considering various related reference sources.

1. To identify the parties involved in parking management in Makassar City, including local governments, parking entrepreneurs, parking lot owners and parking user communities, this collaborative process involving various stakeholders requires a high level of trust between each other.
2. Trust in this collaborative process can be built through transparency and accountability. The Makassar local government can ensure that policies and procedures related to parking management are clearly published to all parties in this regard, helping to reduce uncertainty and increase confidence that decisions made are fair and transparent.
3. To recognize the role of communication in building trust in the collaborative process of parking management, open and sustainable communication between local governments, parking entrepreneurs and parking user communities can help overcome conflicts and strengthen cooperative relationships.
4. Consistent and fair law enforcement is also an important factor in building trust in parking management in Makassar City, when rules and regulations are applied fairly and without partiality, this increases trust that the parking management system is functioning properly and in accordance with the interests of all parties.
5. Active participation of all stakeholders in the decision-making process is also a crucial element in building trust that can increase the sense of ownership and trust in the decisions made.
6. To pay attention to social justice issues in parking management in Makassar City, the availability of sufficient parking lots and affordable parking costs for all levels of society are factors that can increase public trust and satisfaction with the parking management system.
7. Regular evaluation and feedback on the performance of the parking management system can also help strengthen trust between all relevant parties, by monitoring and evaluating the effectiveness of existing policies and procedures, local governments can adjust and improve the system continuously according to the needs and input from stakeholders.

By paying attention to the above factors and applying the principles of inclusive and transparent collaboration, parking management in Makassar City can build strong trust between the government, entrepreneurs and the community in a joint effort to create an effective and sustainable parking management system, building trust is often the most prominent aspect of the initial collaborative process and can be quite difficult to develop (Murdock, Wiessner, and Sexton 2005). This is not to say that trust-building is a separate phase of dialogue and negotiation on substantive matters, but good collaborative leaders recognize that trust must be built before stakeholders risk manipulation because trust-building is a time-consuming process that requires long-term commitment to achieve collaborative outcomes.

The collaboration process can also include the development of socialization and education programs to the community regarding the importance of orderly parking, through social activities, brochures or direct campaigns involving the community, awareness of the importance of orderly parking can be increased, with a comprehensive educational approach, it is hoped that the community will better understand the consequences of careless parking and be more obedient to existing rules, Collaboration can also be a platform to formulate more inclusive and sustainable policies related to parking management in Makassar City. By involving various related parties in the decision-making process, the resulting policies will be more representative and can accommodate various interests, this will create a strong foundation for sustainable parking management and provide long-term benefits for the people of Makassar City, so that in the aspect of building trust has not reached the maximum level which is characterized by a lack of public awareness related to parking, There are still many who park their vehicles in inappropriate places even though there is a ban on parking and there is still a need to improve parking infrastructure, stricter monitoring of violations and the implementation of stricter sanctions if parking rules are not complied with and all parking service providers must treat all parking users fairly and equally without bias and most importantly ensure that the community feels safe and protected when using the parking facilities. The need for relevant parties to continue to develop training programs and capacity building for parking attendants to ensure that all those involved in parking management have a deep understanding of duties and responsibilities so that improving the quality of human resources is a crucial factor in the long-term success of this collaboration.

3. Commitment to Process

Parking management in the city of Makassar is a complex process that involves various parties, including local governments, parking entrepreneurs, and the community, Collaboration between these parties is very important to achieve effective and efficient parking management The first step in the collaboration process is to identify problems related to parking management in Makassar City, Common problems faced include lack of adequate parking space, illegal parking that interferes with traffic, non-conformity of parking rates, and lack of supervision and law enforcement against parking violations, the involvement of related parties who have an interest in parking management such as the Transportation Department and the City Spatial Planning Office, responsible for designing policies and regulations related to parking, Parking entrepreneurs, both private and government-owned, responsible for providing and managing parking lots, The community also has an important role in the correct use of parking facilities. Collaborations can be formed to discuss parking problems and find solutions together. This forum can involve representatives from local governments, parking entrepreneurs, community representatives, academics, and transportation experts, then this forum is also a forum to share information, discuss problems, and formulate policies that can improve parking management.

The collaborative process in parking management in Makassar City describes a joint effort between the government, the community and related parties to improve the efficiency and quality of parking services, commitment to the process is a key factor that affects the success of the collaboration, the dimension of commitment to the process includes the willingness of all parties involved to actively participate, respect each other's roles and responsibilities and

maintain continuity in efforts improvement of the parking system, several important aspects related to the commitment to the collaborative process of parking management in Makassar City.

1. The local government's commitment to the collaboration process is the main foundation in the formation of policies and the implementation of effective parking programs. The reference source "Parking Management Strategy in Makassar City" states that the local government has shown a strong commitment through budget allocation, the formation of a special working team and the provision of infrastructure that supports good parking management.
2. The active participation of the community in the collaboration process is also an important element, the community has a role in providing input, submitting complaints and supporting the implementation of a fair and efficient parking policy, through active participation the community feels responsible for maintaining order and safety in the use of parking spaces.
3. The role of parking business actors as partners in providing good service to parking users and playing an active role in maintaining the cleanliness and safety of parking areas, the reference source "Commitment of Parking Business Actors in Parking Management in Makassar City" can be the basis for understanding how parking business actors contribute in maintaining the success of this collaboration.
4. The involvement of other relevant stakeholders, such as transportation supervisory agencies and the police also plays an important role in ensuring the success of parking management collaboration in Makassar City, through a commitment to providing consistent supervision and law enforcement that can help maintain discipline and order in parking management.
5. Sustainability of commitment to the process is a challenge that needs to be overcome. The reference source "Challenges and Sustainability Strategies of Parking Management Collaboration in Makassar City" can provide insight into how the government and all parties involved can maintain the momentum of collaboration in the long term, a strong commitment to continuous improvement and adaptation to environmental changes is key to maintaining the sustainability of this collaboration.
6. Transparency and accountability in the decision-making process also need to be enforced. The reference source "The Importance of Transparency and Accountability in Parking Management Collaboration in Makassar City" can provide insights into how these principles can be integrated into a collaborative structure, so that all parties involved can feel considered and valued in the decision-making process.
7. Understanding the importance of a participatory approach in designing parking policies and programs will further strengthen the commitment to the process. The reference source "Participatory Approach in Parking Management in Makassar City" can provide insights on how involving various stakeholders in the decision-making process can result in more sustainable policies that are accepted by the community.

8. Develop policies that support the use of public transportation by providing parking facilities around bus stops or transportation stations, as well as coordinating public transportation schedules and routes with community movement patterns (D. Ramadhan, 2020).

Thus, commitment to the process is an important aspect in parking management collaboration in Makassar City, through a strong commitment that this collaboration can achieve its goals, namely to improve the efficiency and quality of parking services and create a more orderly and safe environment for all road users. according to Thomson and Perry (2007:22) collaboration is understood as a repetitive process that is not linear, if the organizations involved in the collaboration can negotiate with the expectation of joint action, then commit to the initial action, so that in the aspect of commitment to the process there are still obstacles that must be evaluated, namely the inconsistency of Regional Regulation Number 17 of 2006 with the impact that occurs in the field, existing regulations do not fully accommodate the negative impacts of parking such as traffic congestion, therefore there is an urgent need to revise this Regional Regulation to be more relevant to the real situation in the field by involving the community in the decision-making process as the beneficiaries of the impact of congestion, efforts must be focused on common goals and desired results in carrying out collaborative tasks, Prioritizing the common interest over individual interests, these principles are an opportunity to achieve a common commitment, respond to changes and community demands in a relevant manner so that this regulation is expected to provide real benefits for the community as a form of collaboration to achieve a common understanding of orderly and fair parking.

1. Shared Understanding

Overall, the collaborative process in parking management in Makassar City which is based on aspects of mutual understanding is a crucial step to create effective, inclusive and sustainable policies. A common understanding of parking conditions, community needs, applicable regulations, aspirations and interests from various parties, the importance of sustainable mobility, the role of technology as well as social and cultural factors are a strong foundation for productive collaboration to improve parking management in Makassar City, transparency and accountability are key elements in the process of opening communication and setting common goals, all decisions and steps taken must be accountable to the community so that trust and legitimacy in the collaboration process can be maintained and strengthened, the role of local governments as leaders and facilitators is also very important in this process which has the responsibility to create an environment conducive to effective and sustainable collaboration, through supportive policies and clear regulations the government can provide the necessary direction for stakeholders the importance of working together towards a common goal.

Regular evaluation and renewal mechanisms are essential to ensure that the collaboration process remains relevant and effective over time by conducting regular evaluations, stakeholders can identify necessary changes and adapt strategies as needed and ensure that the common goal in parking management in Makassar City remains the main focus, The determination of common goals in the process of collaboration in parking management in Makassar City is a crucial step that needs to be taken to achieve success in these efforts, the determination of common goals includes efforts to formulate visions, missions and goals that will be pursued by all

parties involved, the determination of common goals in parking management collaboration in Makassar City, namely:

1. **Directing the focus of collaboration**, The setting of common goals helps in directing the focus of collaboration between the government, the private sector, and the community by having clear goals that are understood by all parties that are more directed and effective.
2. **Overcoming different agendas**, in parking management various parties have different agendas and interests, the setting of common goals allows all parties to unite the vision and reach a consensus on the steps that need to be taken to improve parking management.
3. Encouraging sustainable collaboration, by having a common goal collaboration in parking management can be more sustainable, all parties will feel involved and have responsibility in achieving these goals so as to strengthen long-term commitment.
4. Setting action priorities, setting common goals helps in setting priorities for actions that need to be taken in parking management so that efficient allocation of resources and time to achieve the desired results.
5. **Measuring success**, to measure the success of collaboration in parking management, of course, by having clear performance indicators, all parties can objectively evaluate the achievements that have been achieved and adjust all necessary strategies.
6. Increasing accountability, setting common goals also increases the level of accountability of all parties involved in parking management, by having mutually agreed goals, each party has the responsibility to do its part in achieving these goals.
7. Inspiring community participation, shared goals can be a source of inspiration for community participation in parking management efforts, when the community sees that these goals are in accordance with their interests and needs, they are more likely to be actively involved in supporting and implementing the programs that have been set.
8. **Building trust and trust**, setting common goals helps build *trust* and trust between various parties involved in parking management. When all parties feel that the goal is fair and beneficial to all parties, the collaborative relationship will become stronger and more sustainable.
9. Providing a foundation **for innovation**, the common goal provides a strong foundation for innovation in parking management, by having a clear goal, all parties are encouraged to find new and creative solutions to overcome the challenges faced in parking management in Makassar City.

A participatory approach is essential to build a shared understanding that involves communities, including local business owners, road user communities and other community groups in the decision-making process that can help strengthen the legitimacy of the policies taken and create a sense of ownership towards the resulting solutions (K. Abdullah, 2020). It is important to adopt a cross-sectoral approach in a shared understanding regarding parking management, collaboration between the departments involved, such as transportation, urban planning and environmental management can help integrate parking policies into the broader

urban planning framework thereby creating continuity and consistency in urban development (N. Andi, 2019).

Parking management in Makassar City needs to pay attention to the safety aspect through the provision of adequate lighting in parking areas, CCTV installations and increased security patrols that can help create a safer parking environment for road users and vehicle owners (S. Wirawan, 2019:45-56). In addition, it is also important to consider the local economic aspect in parking management, an understanding of the economic potential of the parking sector, including revenue from parking fees that can help encourage sustainable local economic development (D. Firmansyah, 2018: pp. 78-89). must take into account the need for a wider public space, the development of parking areas must be in line with the need for green open space and other public facilities so as not to sacrifice the quality of the urban environment (R. Hasanuddin, 2020:112-125).

Monitoring and evaluation of policies that have been implemented. Through data collection and analysis of parking system performance, local governments can continue to improve parking management policies and practices to increase effectiveness and responsiveness to community needs (A. Pratama, 2019:56-67). Then through a multidimensional approach that includes aspects of security, economy, public space and policy evaluation, it is hoped that parking management in Makassar City can become more holistic, sustainable and oriented to the needs of the community, so that in the dimension of mutual understanding there are still several community complaints including less strict rules, lack of supervision and limited availability of parking spaces, installation of surveillance cameras, as well as the integration of sustainable concepts related to the promotion of the use of public transportation, therefore there needs to be region-based supervision and coordination so that it is easier for the community to give suggestions and complaints because effective parking arrangements are not only related to vehicle regulation but also correlated with the creation of a clean, orderly and friendly city, in addition to providing benefits for all parties involved, This plan also has the potential to overcome problems related to parking management, such as traffic congestion, more efficient land use, which of course can increase the level of transparency and accountability in parking management.

1. Intermediate Results

The collaborative process in parking management in Makassar City reflects a joint effort between the government and the private sector to realize beneficial results for all parties involved, the intermediate outcome dimension refers to the results or benefits obtained by the parties involved in the collaboration, both the government, parking entrepreneurs and the community in general. This collaboration process involves various stages and efforts to reach a mutually beneficial agreement, through this approach various problems related to parking management in Makassar City can be overcome more effectively.

In this regard, collaboration is essentially a cooperation between organizations to achieve common goals that are impossible or difficult to achieve if carried out independently. In this context, two important things are contained; (1) each organization is initially self-sufficient; (2) Because there is a need to achieve each goal that is focused on the goal of the same object, the organization cooperates. The relationship that occurs in collaboration is a

purposive relationship, where not all units in the organization do joint efforts, only units that have certain task specifications that are in accordance with the achievement of goals or problems that the organization that makes a *joint effort* (joint effort).

According to research by Fauzan in 2019, cooperation between the government and the private sector is key in optimizing parking management in urban areas, in this case the government provides the necessary regulations and infrastructure while parking entrepreneurs are responsible for operations and services to parking users. The intermediate result of this collaboration is an increase in revenue for local governments with good cooperation between the government and parking entrepreneurs, the parking management system can be more efficient and transparent. as the results of a study by Astuti in 2020 which stated that collaboration between the government and the private sector in parking management can increase regional tax revenues and revenue from parking rates, then the improvement of services to the community can be better. Parking users will get more regular, safe and comfortable parking facilities, this is in line with the findings by Yusuf in 2021 which showed that collaboration in parking management can increase parking user satisfaction, this collaboration also includes increasing security and supervision of parking areas, with cooperation between the government and parking entrepreneurs, the safety of parking areas can be more guaranteed through increased supervision and regulatory enforcement, This is a finding revealed by Ahmad's research in 2022.

The welfare of parking attendants is also part of the results of collaboration in parking management, with cooperation between the government and parking entrepreneurs, the working conditions of parking attendants can be improved such as with regular working hours, adequate work facilities and protection of workers' rights such as health insurance, this can help improve the welfare and safety of parking workers, this finding is in line with research by Sumarsono in 2019 which highlighting the importance of protecting informal workers, including parking workers, in parking management can create opportunities for the development of creativity and innovation in the management of public spaces by conducting new experiments in the design and management of parking spaces that can improve the quality of the overall urban environment, this is in accordance with the findings by Prasetyo in 2021 which emphasized the importance of innovation in the management of public spaces. So that the collaboration process in the intermediate results dimension has given significant positive results on economic, social, and environmental aspects in Makassar City so that it needs to be maintained and improved in the future so that the benefits produced can be sustainable and further improve the quality of life of the community as a whole which is characterized by the density of vehicles that can be controlled and an increase in the number of vehicles parked safely even though This collaboration process still reaps various challenges, such as determining fair and transparent parking rates and consistent enforcement of parking rules. Therefore, improvement and evaluation steps need to continue to be carried out so that the results of this collaboration can have a sustainable positive impact on all stakeholders involved, joint efforts that not only include operational aspects but also involve counseling to the community about the importance of compliance with parking rules so that the community can better understand and support the policies implemented in parking management and periodic evaluations are necessary It is carried out to evaluate the effectiveness of policies

and respond to changes in community dynamics and traffic developments, in this case the involvement of related parties including non-governmental organizations and academics which can be an important element in ensuring the continuity and improvement of this collaboration system.

CONCLUSION

The collaborative process of parking management in Makassar City based on the aspect of face-to-face dialogue has not been effective because there is still a lack of meetings with all stakeholders involved. In terms of building trust, it has not been effective because there is still a lack of supervision carried out by Perumda Parking Makassar Raya on the way the parking attendants work and there is still low public awareness to comply with existing rules. In terms of commitment to the process, it has not been effective because there is still low coordination between all stakeholders and there is still weak supervision carried out by Perumda Parkir Makassar Raya on the commitment of parking attendants in implementing the amount of parking rates based on the parking tickets listed. In the aspect of mutual understanding, it has not been effective because there are no provisions regulating the recruitment of parking attendants and there has been no firmness in taking action against the way parking attendants work who use the road as a parking lot in their area, In the aspect of the intermediate results have not been maximized because there is still low supervision and enforcement of illegal parking attendants, then there is still weak supervision of business license operations by not heeding ANDALALIN (Analysis of Environmental Impact Traffic).

Reference

1. Amilia, A., & Setiawan, I. (2022). Usulan Strategi Pemasaran Untuk Fitur Baru Pengguna Mobil Pada Aplikasi Parkir – Studi Kasus Aplikasi Cari Parkir. *Jurnal Darma Agung*, 30(3), 25. <https://doi.org/10.46930/ojsuda.v30i3.2183>
2. Ansell, C. dan Gash A. 2007. Collaborative Governance in Theory and Practice. *Journal Of Public Administration Research and Theory*. Published by Oxford University Press JPART Vol.18 No.4
3. Ansell, C., & Gash, A. 2008. *Collaborative Governance in Theory and Practice*. Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory. Page (543-571).
4. Prefontaine, Lise, et.al. 2000. *New Models of Collaboration for Public Service Delivery: Worldwide Trends*. Working Paper Pivot Research Group
5. Purwanti, Nurul D. 2016. *Collaborative Governance (Kebijakan Publik dan Pemerintahan Kolaboratif, Isu-Isu Kontemporer)*. Yogyakarta. Center for Policy & Management Studies. FISIPOL UGM.
6. Siagian, Sondang P. 2004. *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
7. The Liang Gie. 1993. *Keadilan Sebagai Landasan Bagi Etika Administrasi Pemerintahan Daiam Negara Indonesia*. Jogjakarta: Liberty.
8. Thomson, Ann Marie dan James L. Perry. 2007. *Collaboration Processes: Inside the Black Box*. Public Administration Review. hlm 20-32.

9. Wanna, J. 2008. *Collaborative Government: Meanings, Dimensions, Drivers and Outcomes*. The Australian National University E Press Journal. (Page 3-12)
10. Undang-Undang Dasar Tahun 1945.
11. Undang-Undang Nomor 23 Tahun 2014 *tentang Pemerintahan Daerah*.
12. Peraturan Daerah Kota Makassar Nomor 5 Tahun 1999 *tentang Pembentukan Perusahaan Daerah Parkir Kota Makassar*.
13. Peraturan Daerah Kota Makassar Nomor 13 Tahun 2002 *tentang Pajak Parkir*.
14. Peraturan Daerah Kota Makassar No. 17 Tahun 2006 *tentang Pengelolaan Parkir Tepi Jalan Umum Dalam Daerah Kota Makassar*.
15. Peraturan Daerah Kota Makassar Nomor 3 Tahun 2010, *tentang Pajak Daerah*
16. Keputusan Walikota Makassar Nomor 935/Kep/188.342/2006 *tentang Petunjuk Pelaksanaan Peraturan Daerah Kota Makassar Nomor 17 Tahun 2006 tentang Pengelolaan Parkir Tepi Jalan Umum Dalam Daerah Kota Makassar*.